

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

FUND LIQUIDATION HOLDINGS LLC, as assignee and successor-in-interest to FrontPoint Asian Event Driven Fund L.P., MOON CAPITAL PARTNERS MASTER FUND LTD., and MOON CAPITAL MASTER FUND LTD., on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CITIBANK, N.A., BANK OF AMERICA, N.A., JPMORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A., THE ROYAL BANK OF SCOTLAND PLC, UBS AG, BNP PARIBAS, S.A., OVERSEA-CHINESE BANKING CORPORATION LTD., BARCLAYS BANK PLC, DEUTSCHE BANK AG, CREDIT AGRICOLE CORPORATE AND INVESTMENT BANK, CREDIT SUISSE AG, STANDARD CHARTERED BANK, DBS BANK LTD., ING BANK, N.V., UNITED OVERSEAS BANK LIMITED, AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND BANKING GROUP, LTD., THE BANK OF TOKYO-MITSUBISHI UFJ, LTD., THE HONGKONG AND SHANGHAI BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED, COMMERZBANK AG, AND JOHN DOES NOS. 1-50,

Defendants.

Docket No.: 1:16-cv-05263-AKH

**MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN
SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS'
MOTION FOR LEAVE TO
FILE A RESPONSE TO
PLAINTIFFS' SUR-REPLY IN
OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS'
MOTION TO DISMISS THE
FOURTH AMENDED
CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT**

This Court granted Plaintiffs leave to file a sur-reply (the “Sur-Reply”) of no more than five (5) pages (ECF No. 463) so that Plaintiffs could address the Second Circuit’s decision in *Schwab Short-Term Bond Market Fund v. Lloyds Banking Group PLC*, 22 F.4th 103 (2d Cir. 2021) (“*Schwab II*”), which was decided after Plaintiffs filed their opposition to the undersigned Defendants’ motion to dismiss the Fourth Amended Class Action Complaint.¹ Plaintiffs’ Sur-Reply mischaracterizes *Schwab II* by claiming that the decision supports Plaintiffs’ positions that the Moon Plaintiffs are efficient enforcers of the antitrust laws and that the Moon Plaintiffs’ two alleged transactions with one defendant establish conspiracy jurisdiction over all Defendants. (Sur-Reply at 1-4.) Further, the Sur-Reply contains arguments about the timeliness of the Moon Plaintiffs’ claims that have nothing to do with *Schwab II* and are a belated and procedurally improper attempt to plug a glaring hole in Plaintiffs’ opposition to Defendants’ motion to dismiss. (Sur-Reply at 5.)

Defendants should be permitted to respond to these arguments, which were raised for the first time in the Sur-Reply. As movants, Defendants are “shouldered with the ultimate burden on the motion and [] therefore should be (for reasons of judicial efficiency and simple fairness) afforded the last word on the motion.” *Estate of Loveria v. Portadam, Inc.*, 2010 WL 11541909, at *2 (N.D.N.Y. June 9, 2010). Moreover, permitting Defendants to respond to Plaintiffs’ Sur-Reply would allow the Court to decide Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss with the benefit of a complete record that includes full briefing on *Schwab II*, which is an important decision on key issues of law. *Broadfoot v. Barrick Gold Corp.*, 2017 WL 3738444, at *1 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 9, 2017) (granting permission to file a sur-sur-reply in order to “engage now in a fuller examination of” an issue before the court).

¹ Unless otherwise indicated, all capitalized terms have the same meaning ascribed to them in Defendants’ Memorandum of Law in Support of Defendants’ Joint Motion to Dismiss the Fourth Amended Class Action

Accordingly, Defendants respectfully request that the Court grant Defendants leave to file a brief in response to Plaintiffs' Sur-Reply of no more than five (5) pages that is substantially the same in form and substance as the proposed brief attached hereto as Exhibit A.

Dated: New York, New York
February 4, 2022²

/s/ Penny Shane

Penny Shane
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
125 Broad Street
New York, New York 10004
Telephone: (212) 558-4000
Fax: (212) 558-3588
shanep@sullcrom.com

Brendan P. Cullen
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
1870 Embarcadero Road
Palo Alto, California 94303
Telephone: (650) 461-5600
Fax: (650) 461-5700
cullenb@sullcrom.com

/s/ Arthur J. Burke

Lawrence Portnoy
Arthur J. Burke
Paul S. Mishkin
Adam G. Mehes
DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP
450 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10017
Telephone: (212) 450-4000
Fax: (212) 701-5800
lawrence.portnoy@davispolk.com
arthur.burke@davispolk.com
paul.mishkin@davispolk.com
adam.mehes@davispolk.com

Attorneys for defendant Bank of America, N.A.

Attorneys for defendant Australia and New Zealand Banking Group, Ltd.

Complaint (ECF No. 447) (the "Opening Brief" or "Br."). All internal quotation marks and citations are omitted.

² All electronic signatures ("s/") are signed with consent of counsel pursuant to Rule 8.5 of this Court's Electronic Case Filing Rules & Instructions, as of February 1, 2021.

/s/ *Jeffrey T. Scott*

Jeffrey T. Scott
Matthew J. Porpora
Stephen H. O. Clarke
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
125 Broad Street
New York, New York 10004
Telephone: (212) 558-4000
Fax: (212) 558-3588
scottj@sullcrom.com
porporam@sullcrom.com
clarkest@sullcrom.com

Attorneys for defendant Barclays Bank PLC

/s/ *David R. Gelfand*

David R. Gelfand
MILBANK LLP
55 Hudson Yards
New York, New York 10001
Telephone: (212) 530-5000
Fax: (212) 530-5219
dgelfand@milbank.com

Mark D. Villaverde
MILBANK LLP
2029 Century Park East, 33rd Floor
Los Angeles, California 90067
Telephone: (424) 386-4000
Fax: (213) 892-4743
mvillaverde@milbank.com

Attorneys for defendant Commerzbank AG

/s/ *Jayant W. Tambe*

Jayant W. Tambe
Kelly A. Carrero
JONES DAY
250 Vesey Street
New York, New York 10281
Telephone: (212) 326-3939
Fax: (212) 755-7306
jtambe@jonesday.com
kacarrero@jonesday.com

Attorneys for defendant BNP Paribas, S.A.

/s/ *Andrew Hammond*

Andrew Hammond
Kimberly Anne Havlin
WHITE & CASE LLP
1221 Avenue of the Americas
New York, New York 10020
Telephone: (212) 819-8200
Fax: (212) 354-8113
ahammond@whitecase.com
kim.havlin@whitecase.com

Darryl S. Lew
WHITE & CASE LLP
701 Thirteenth Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005
Telephone: (202) 626-3600
Fax: (202) 639-9355
dlew@whitecase.com

*Attorneys for defendant Crédit Agricole
Corporate and Investment Bank*

/s/ *Erica S. Weisgerber*

Erica S. Weisgerber
Matthew D. Forbes
DEBEVOISE & PLIMPTON LLP
919 Third Avenue
New York, New York 10022
Telephone: (212) 909-6000
Fax: (212) 909-6836
eweisgerber@debevoise.com
mforbes@debevoise.com

Attorneys for defendant DBS Bank Ltd.

/s/ *C. Fairley Spillman*

C. Fairley Spillman
AKIN GUMP STRAUSS HAUER &
FELD LLP
2001 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036
Telephone: (202) 887-4409
fspillman@akingump.com

*Attorney for defendant Oversea-Chinese
Banking Corporation, Ltd.*

/s/ *Christopher M. Viapiano*

Christopher M. Viapiano
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
1700 New York Avenue, N.W., Suite 700
Washington, D.C. 20006
Telephone: (202) 956-7500
Fax: (202) 293-6330
viapianoc@sullcrom.com

*Attorney for defendant MUFG Bank, Ltd. (f/k/a
The Bank of Tokyo-Mitsubishi UFJ, Ltd.)*

/s/ *David S. Lesser*

David S. Lesser
Laura Harris
KING & SPALDING LLP
1185 Avenue of the Americas
34th Floor
New York, New York 10036
Telephone: (212) 556-2100
dlesser@kslaw.com
lharris@kslaw.com

G. Patrick Montgomery
KING & SPALDING LLP
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
2nd Floor
Washington, D.C. 20006
Telephone: (202) 737-0500
pmontgomery@kslaw.com

*Attorneys for defendant The Royal Bank of
Scotland plc (n/k/a NatWest Markets plc)*

/s/ *Marc J. Gottridge*

Marc J. Gottridge
Lisa J. Fried
HERBERT SMITH FREEHILLS NEW
YORK LLP
450 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10017
Telephone: (917) 542-7600
marc.gottridge@hsf.com
lisa.fried@hsf.com

Benjamin A. Fleming
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
390 Madison Avenue
New York, New York 10017
Telephone: (212) 918-3000
benjamin.fleming@hoganlovells.com

*Attorneys for defendant Standard Chartered
Bank*

/s/ *Dale C. Christensen, Jr.*

Dale C. Christensen, Jr.
Michael G. Considine
Noah Czarny
SEWARD & KISSEL LLP
One Battery Park Plaza
New York, New York 10004
Telephone: (212) 574-1200
Fax: (212) 480-8421
christensen@sewkis.com
considine@sewkis.com
czarny@sewkis.com

*Attorneys for defendant United Overseas Bank
Limited*

/s/ *Eric J. Stock*

Mark A. Kirsch
Eric J. Stock
Jefferson E. Bell
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP
200 Park Avenue
New York, New York 10166-0193
Telephone: (212) 351-4000
Fax: (212) 351-4035
mkirsch@gibsondunn.com
estock@gibsondunn.com
jbell@gibsondunn.com

Attorneys for defendant UBS AG